

STATE OF WASHINGTON KING COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT

STATE OF WASHINGTON,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

٧.

NO. 11-2-18746-2SEA

Plaintiff,

STIPULATED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, JUDGMENT AND DECREE

SOLE, INC., a Washington Corporation; and KYUNGOK NAM, also known as Remy Nam, individually and as Owner of Sole, Inc.,

Defendants.

I. JUDGMENT SUMMARY

Judgment Creditor: 1.1 17 Judgment Debtors: 1.2 18 1.3 Principal Judgment Amount: 19 Attorney for Judgment Creditor:

1.4

State of Washington

\$37,986.24

Sole, Inc., and Kyungok Nam

Paula Selis, Senior Counsel

Attorney for Judgment Debtors: Soloman Kim 1.5

Plaintiff, State of Washington, having filed a Complaint for Injunctive and Other Relief on

Defendants having accepted service of the Complaint herein; and

Plaintiff appearing by and through its attorneys, Robert M. McKenna, Attorney General, and Paula Selis, Senior Counsel; and

STIPULATED JUDGMENT

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WASHINGTON Consumer Protection Division 800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000 Seattle, WA 98104-3188 . (206) 464-7745

Defendants Sole, Inc. and Kyungok Nam (hereinafter "Defendants") appearing by and through their attorney, Soloman Kim; and;

Plaintiff and Defendants having stipulated and agreed upon a basis for resolving the matters alleged in the Complaint herein and to the entry of this Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, Judgment and Decree (hereinafter "Decree") pursuant to CR 54; and

The Court having determined that there is no just reason for delay in the entry of a final judgment against Defendants, and being fully advised, the Court hereby makes and enters the following:

II. FINDINGS OF FACT

- 2.1 Defendant Sole, Inc. is a Washington corporation. Its principal place of business is located at 317 112th Avenue N.E., Apt.#1322, Bellevue, WA 98004.
- 2.2 Defendant Kyungok Nam, also known as Remy Nam, is and has at all times relevant to this action been the Owner and Officer of defendant Sole, Inc. As the Owner and Officer of Sole, Inc., Defendant Kyungok Nam has control over Sole, Inc.'s policies, practices, and activities. Defendant Kyungok Nam resides at 317 112th Ave N.E., Apt.# 1322, Bellevue, WA 98004.
- At all times material to this action, Defendants have promoted, advertised, marketed, and sold massage chairs, bathtubs, range hoods, sinks, faucets and other household goods through their Web sites, www.thefactoryoutlet.com; www.goodchairs.com; www.mybidets.com; www.mybidets.com to consumers across the country. Defendants have also sold their products via telephone. The prices for Defendants' products range from small rugs costing less than \$100.00 to massage chairs costing more than \$6,000.00.

- 2.4 When consumers place orders on Defendants' websites, Defendants accept these orders and charge consumers' credit cards, or obtain payment through Paypal or Google checkout.
- 2.5 Defendants have solicited, advertised, and sold products in King County, Washington and are in competition with others in the State of Washington engaged in similar business.
- 2.6 Throughout their business dealings, Defendants agree to deliver various household goods to consumers. In reliance on Defendants' agreement to deliver these products, consumers place orders on Defendants' Web site and submit payment for their orders. However, despite the fact that Defendants accept consumers' payment, in some instances, Defendants fail to deliver consumers' orders.
- 2.7 Defendants, in the regular course of business, make or have made a number of misrepresentations, including but not limited to the following:
 - Defendants represent that they can deliver various household products to consumers placing orders on their Web site. Their website states: "All orders are processed between 7 a.m. and 5 p.m. (PST), Monday through Friday. Your order will be shipped within 48 hours, unless otherwise noted."

 http://thefactoryoutlet.com/corp/helpdesk.asp, September 20, 2010. In fact, after charging consumers' credit cards for their orders, in some instances, Defendants fail to deliver consumers' orders within the time represented, and in some instances fail to deliver the product at all.
 - b. When consumers contact Defendants' about the status of their late shipments, Defendants in some cases represent that the delays are ascribable to various issues outside of their control, such as errors made

by the salesperson who sold the item, problems with the factory, and shipping issues. In such instances, Defendants promise a new delivery date for the item. In fact, in many instances, the item is not delivered on the date promised.

malfunctioning products purchased from Defendants. Defendants represent that they will provide the support necessary to fix the product, by ordering a new part or sending out a technician to fix the problem. In some instances, Defendants fail to do so.

III. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 3.1 The Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this action and of the parties hereto, and plaintiff's Complaint states claims upon which relief may be granted.
- 3.2 The Attorney General has jurisdiction to bring this action under RCW 19.86.080 and RCW 19.86.040.
- 3.3 Defendants' conduct as described in Findings of Fact Nos. 2.1 through 2.7 constitute violations of the Consumer Protection Act, RCW 19.86 et seq.
- 3.4 Plaintiff is entitled to a Decree ordering Defendants to pay the amounts as described herein.
- 3.5 Plaintiff is entitled to a Decree enjoining Defendants from the acts and practices described herein.

The Court having made the foregoing Finding of Fact and Conclusions of Law, and in accordance therewith, the Court enters the following:

(206) 464-7745

	3		(
	4	-]
	5		
	6		(
	7		I
	8		ŗ
	9		
1	0		
1	1		
1	2		
1	3		
1	4		
1	5		
1	6		
1	7		
1	8		
1	9		
2	Ó		
2	1		
2:	2		
2.	3		
24	4		
2:	5		tŀ
26	5		aı
		11	

1

2

IV. JUDGMENT AND DECREE

- 4.1 Defendants and their successors, assigns, transferees, officers, agents, servants, directors, employees, and all other person or entities in active concert or participation with Defendants shall be informed of the terms and conditions of this Order.
- 4.2 Defendants and their successors, assigns, transferees, officers, agents, servants, directors, employees, and all other persons or entities in active concert or participation with Defendants are hereby enjoined and restrained from engaging in the following acts and practices:
 - a. charging consumers' credit cards for orders before their orders have been delivered;
 - b. failing to deliver consumers' orders;
 - c. failing to notify consumers via email on the date their orders have been shipped, and providing them with a tracking number for the shipment, if such tracking number exists;
 - failing to respond to consumer inquiries within forty-eight hours of
 Defendants' receipt of the consumer's inquiry;
 - e. making any misrepresentations in the context of the sale, marketing, delivery or repair of any product or service;
 - f. misrepresenting that items are in stock;
 - g. misrepresenting the delivery date of an item; and
 - h. Violating any provisions of the Unfair-Business Practices—Consumer Protection Act, RCW 19.86.

V. COSTS, ATTORNEY FEES AND CIVIL PENALTIES

5.1 Pursuant to RCW 19.86.080, Plaintiff shall recover and Defendants shall pay the costs and reasonable attorney fees incurred by Plaintiff in pursuing this matter in the amount of \$14,728.24.

5.2 Pursuant to RCW 19.86.140, Plaintiff shall recover and Defendants shall pay a civil penalty of \$90,000.00, provided that such amount shall be suspended upon compliance with the terms of this Decree.

VI. RESTITUTION

- 6.1 Pursuant to RCW 19.86.080, Defendants shall pay consumer restitution in the total amount of \$23,258.00 to the persons listed in Exhibit A, attached hereto. The restitution shall be paid to the Attorney General's Office according to the schedule described below in Paragraph 7.1. At the conclusion of the 240-day period following the entry of this Stipulated Judgment, after Defendants have paid the full amount of restitution, the Attorney General's Office shall disburse the restitution funds to the persons listed in Exhibit A, in the amounts referenced therein.
- 6.2 In addition to the consumers listed in Exhibit A, Defendants shall also issue refunds to consumers who are identified after the time of entry of this Stipulated Judgment, and who paid for orders and either did not receive those orders or failed to receive a refund. Those consumers shall include persons identified in complaints that are forwarded to Defendants by the Washington State Attorney General's Office or any other agency, or which are received through any means by Defendants at any time after the date of the signing of this Stipulated Judgment. Should consumers in addition to those listed in Exhibit A be identified to Defendants, Defendants shall provide restitution directly to those consumers within seven days of receiving their complaints.

VII. PAYMENT

7.1 Payments owing under the provisions of this Stipulated Judgment at Paragraphs 5.1 and 6.1 shall be in the form of valid checks paid to the order of the "Attorney General—State of Washington" and shall be due and owing in accordance with the schedule set forth in below. Payment shall be sent to the Office of the Attorney General, Attention: Cynthia

(206) 464-7745

1	Lockridge, Administ	rative Office Manager, 800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000, Seattle, Washington
2	98104.	
3	a.	On June 1, 2011 a payment of \$2,584.22 shall be due and owing, which
4		shall be applied toward payment of restitution;
5	b,	Within 30 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.22 shall
6		be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of restitution
7		and .
8	c.	Within 60 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.22 shall
9		be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of restitution
10		and
11	d.	Within 90 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.22 shall
12		be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of restitution;
13		and
14	e.	Within 120 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.22
15	•	shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of
16		restitution; and
17	f.	Within 150 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.22
18		shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of
19		restitution; and
20	g.	Within 180 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.22
21		shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of
22		restitution; and
23	h,	Within 210 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.22
24		shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of
25		restitution; and
26	•	

2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	

- i. Within 240 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$2,584.23 shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of restitution; and
- j. Within 270 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$4,909.41 shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of attorney fees and costs; and
- k. Within 300 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$4,909.41 shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of attorney fees and costs; and
- 1. Within 330 days of the entry of this Decree, a payment of \$4,909.42 shall be due and owing, which shall be applied toward payment of attorney fees and costs.

VIII. ENFORCEMENT

- 8.1 Violation of any of the terms contained in this Stipulated Judgment shall subject Defendants to a civil penalty of up to \$25,000.00 per violation pursuant to RCW 19.86.140.
- 8.2 In any action to enforce the terms of this Decree, Plaintiff may seek additional remedies, including, but not limited to, restitution, injunctive relief, and reasonable attorneys' fees and costs, in addition to any other remedies permitted by law.
- 8.3 This Stipulated Judgment is entered pursuant to RCW 19.86.080. Jurisdiction is retained for the purpose of enabling any party to this Stipulated Judgment with or without the prior consent of the other party to apply to the Court at any time for enforcement of compliance with this Stipulated Judgment, to punish violations thereof, or to modify or clarify this Stipulated Judgment.
- 8.4 Representatives of the Office of the Attorney General shall be permitted to access, inspect and/or copy all business records or documents under control of Defendants in order to

monitor compliance with this Stipulated Judgment within fourteen (14) days of written request to Defendants, provided that the inspection and copying shall be done in such a way as to avoid disruption of Defendants' business activities. Failure to comply with this section will be considered a violation of the terms of this Stipulated Judgment.

- 8.5 Representatives of the Office of the Attorney General may be permitted to question Defendants, or any officer, director, agent, or employee of any business organization affiliated with Defendants, in the form of a deposition, pursuant to the provisions and notice requirements of CR 30, and to issue interrogatories and requests for production of documents, pursuant to the provisions and notice requirements of CR 33 and CR 34, in order to monitor compliance with this Stipulated Judgment.
- 8.6 Nothing in this Stipulated Judgment shall be construed as to limit or bar any other governmental entity or consumer from pursuing other available remedies against Defendants.
- 8.7 Under no circumstances shall this Stipulated Judgment or the name of the State of Washington, the Office of the Attorney General, Consumer Protection Division, or any of their employees or representatives be used by Defendants in connection with any selling, advertising, or promotion of products or services, or as an endorsement or approval of Defendants' acts, practices or conduct of business.
- 8.8 This Stipulated Judgment resolves all issues raised by the Attorney General under the Consumer Protection Act pertaining to the acts or omissions addressed in the Complaint filed in this matter.

IX. DISMISSAL AND WAIVER OF CLAIMS

9.1 Upon entry of this Stipulated Judgment, all claims in this matter not otherwise addressed by this Stipulated Judgment are dismissed.

4 1	in the second
1	9.2 Upon Defendants' complete performance and final payment of the monetary
2	obligations listed in this Stipulation, the Plaintiff shall deliver a Satisfaction of Monetary
3	Judgment to Defendants. MAY 26 2011
4	DONE IN OPEN COURT this day of, 2011
5	
6	ence. Waress
7	JUDGE/COURT COMMISSIONER
8	Presented by: Approved for Entry, Notice of Presentation
9	Waived:
10	ROBERT M. MCKENNA ORION LAW FIRM, PLLC
11	Attorney General
12	PAULA SELIS, WSBA #12823 SOLOMAN KIM, WSBA # 25435
13	Senior Counsel Attorney for Sole, Inc. and Kyungok Nam Attorneys for Plaintiff
14	State of Washington
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	-
22.	
23	
24	
25	
26	
20	

10